PEER REVIEW WORKSHEET

MATH 105-6: FRESHMAN SEMINAR: THEORIES OF MIND AND MATHEMATICS PROF. THEO JOHNSON-FREYD, NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY, SPRING 2014

Author's name:

Reviewer's name:

DO IN CLASS

Read through your partners' essays carefully. As you read through them, jot down questions/comments that you have, and also number the paragraphs as you go. Complete a copy of this worksheet for each essay that you read. At the end of today, the authors should take the worksheets for their papers, and follow the instructions under "Due by Thursday" below.

(1) In one or two sentences, summarize what you take to be the main point/thesis of the essay.

(2) Does the essay broadcast this thesis clearly, in the title and introduction? If not, suggest ways to improve it.

(3) Is the essay structured (and this structure sign-posted) in a way that aids the reader? What evidence is presented, and how does it support the main point? List for each paragraph its specific purpose in the essay (this is why you numbered the paragraphs): in a phrase or sentence, write what you take to be the evidence and/or sub-argument presented in that paragraph.

- (4) Look for grammatically incorrect sentences, and mark them as you see them. Be on particular lookout for missing or repeated words, misplaced punctuation, subject/verb disagreement, and run-on sentences. Note also other errors of usage, mechanics, and formatting. For example, are references correctly cited, and listed in a correctly-formatted bibliography?
- (5) List at least one thing you like about the paper's style/voice/diction. List at least one sentence that could be usefully rewritten to improve its style/voice/diction.

(6) Finally, if you disagree with the author's arguments, tell them so, and explain why.

When everyone has read all the papers, be sure to spend some time discussing the ideas presented.

DUE BY THURSDAY

By next time (Thursday, May 1), please send a second copy of your paper to theojf@math.northwestern. edu, with revisions as necessary. I expect that many of you will not need to make many revisions — the versions you wrote for today were generally good — but I will "grade" whatever you send me on Thursday.

In that same email, include a list of all revisions made. Equally importantly, there may be revisions suggested by your reviewers that you choose not to make — for each of these, include a sentence about why you did not make that revision.

Please also turn in these review worksheets on Thursday.